PreK-12 Research on Education Strategies to Advance Recovery and Turnaround (RESTART) Network

Task 2: Scan and Synthesis of Recovery Needs and Activities

Elisabeth Davis, Rebecca Steingut, Melissa Rodgers, Tia Clinton, and Kelisa Cain.

Last updated July 8, 2023

RESTART Network

Contents

Purpose and Research Goals

The purpose of this project is to address the Task 2 goals of the PreK–12 COVID-19 Recovery RESTART Network. This protocol details the how we will conduct the ongoing scans of pandemic recovery needs and activities as well as the procedures to synthesize the research. Specifically, we specify how we will conduct a broad scan of primary and secondary information, including (a) sources to be searched, (b) inclusion and exclusion criteria, and (c) how resulting information will be categorized (e.g., needs and activities associated with connecting families with school lunches, social and emotional skills, academic achievement, and school engagement; types of activities such as program, policy, or practice).

Research Questions for Synthesis:

1. What recovery-related needs have been cited by state and local education agencies, and how have they changed over time?

2. What activities were planned by state and local education agencies to address these needs? To what extent were they implemented as intended, and to what extent have implemented activities shifted in tandem with changing needs?

3. Were there any needs that were cited that were not addressed by an activity, even if states and districts originally reported plans to do so?

4. To what extent are the impacts of recovery-related activities being studied or monitored?

5. For each question above, what is the variability by topic area, student group, region, and instructional mode?

Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria

Setting

Studies should describe the needs or activities targeted at COVID-19 education recovery efforts. The program, practice, product or policy should have implications for early childhood, elementary, middle and high school students in the United States or for their teachers. The setting is not limited to within the school system or physical setting and may include afterschool, summer programs, and cultural institutions (e.g., museums). Note that we will be coding at whatever level the artifact reports on, which could be at the school, district, LEA, or SEA level; we will always note the state(s) for summary purposes.

Grade

The study must be focused on or include grades pre-K-12 during the first time point in the study. Studies that focus on post-secondary or before pre-kindergarten will be excluded.

Timeframe

To be included, studies must be published (or dated, for unpublished studies) in March 2020 to present.

Publication Status

We plan to include all types of study reports, published or unpublished.

Language

Studies must be published in English.

Country

Studies must be conducted in the United States and focused on the United States education system.

Outcomes

We use the term outcome measures to refer to both measures used to assess an intervention in activity artifact studies, as well as the underlying intended outcome.

Table 1 lists the eligible macro-construct and micro-construct domains. Outcome domains are based on the most recent standards and practices in the field. We drew the initial list of eligible outcomes from the What Works Clearinghouse (WWC) Study Review Protocol (version 5.0). In addition, to make sense of outcomes such as social and emotional learning, we consulted the CASEL framework and subject matter experts. The studies reviewed under this protocol cover a diverse set of interventions that examine a large set of outcomes. The outcome domains identified in the protocol are drawn from prior topic area protocols with minor adjustments and include outcomes that are of interest to the education community and consumers of the WWC. We will also expand the list to include mental health and physical health outcomes. The goal of the scan is to be as inclusive as possible of any eligible student outcomes, so this list will expand throughout the scan process.

Table 1. Eligible Outcomes

Domain name (Macro-construct)	Construct name and description (Micro-construct)
English Achievement	**What they have learned in school. Assessments and grades to determine proficiency in English/Reading related subjects.** • SAT/ACT English Scores • SAT/ACT Written Scores • Standardized ELA test (including state, national or other) • English/Writing Proficiency Rate • ELA Course Grades (including pass or fail)
Social-Emotional Learning/ Behavioral and Mental Health	**Measures related to student functioning and well-being including: social and emotional learning soft skill development, student behavior, and mental health. Social and emotional learning may be understood as the process of developing skills such as self-awareness, self-control, and other interpersonal skills that allow students to develop positive collegial relationships and build essential skills necessary for school, work, and life success. CASEL defines SEL as "the process through which all young people and adults acquire and apply the knowledge, skills, and attitudes to develop healthy identities, manage emotions and achieve personal and collective goals, feel and show empathy for others, establish and maintain supportive relationships, and make responsible and caring decisions (CASEL 2023; https://casel.org/fundamentals-of-sel/)."** *Note: Measures may be based on extant data, self-reports, observations, results from an assessment scale.* • Functional Skills • Social and emotional skills (e.g., self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, relationship skills, responsible decision-making, emotional regulation, respecting others, interrupting others, and overall adjustment, intrapersonal Competencies) • Student Discipline (e.g., suspensions, office referrals, expulsions, detention, arrests) • Anti-social behavior (interrupting others, peer rejection, and physical or verbal aggression; cheating, lying, stealing) • Substance use/abuse • Mental health (depression, anxiety, loneliness, well-being, adjustment)

Domain name (Macro-construct)	Construct name and description (Micro-construct)
Motivation	**Cognitive and motivational processes relating to school or learning** • Motivational Beliefs (attributions, Growth mindset) • Motivation Value (utility, attainment, cost, intrinsic value, attitude, interest) • Positive emotions (enjoyment, happiness) • Negative emotions (boredom, frustration, anxiety when framed in terms of school i.e., math anxiety) • Motivation Identity (self-concept, self-esteem, positive identity development) • Motivation Competence (competence, confidence, self-efficacy. goals and values, paying attention) • Engagement (grit, effort, behavioral engagement, time on task)
Belonging/School Climate	**Measures related to 'the extent to which students feel personally accepted, respected, included, and supported by others in the school social environment' (Goodenow 1993)** • Quality of social interactions • Safety • Sense of belonging (school bonding), including sense of alienation • Perceptions of school climate • Teacher expectations • Teacher support • Student/teacher relationships • Peer relationships • Parental involvement
Teacher Outcomes	**Measures related to teacher professional development, well-being, job satisfaction and practice.** • Teaching Skills and Techniques to improve Instructional Mode (e.g., remote vs. in-person vs. hybrid) • Teacher Self-Efficacy • Teacher Retention & Teacher Pipeline • Teacher well-being (teacher satisfaction, burnout, perceived ability to do one's job, intentions to continue teaching, perceived leadership support, workload, and job-related stress and anxiety, including emotional exhaustion) • Teacher Attendance • Teacher practice (e.g., quality of instruction; application of developmentally appropriate knowledge of content and/or pedagogy; classroom management; classroom observations)

Domain name (Macro-construct)	Construct name and description (Micro-construct)
General Achievement	**Academic performance related measures to assess proficiency across multiple academic domains/subject areas.** • GPA • SAT/ACT Composite Scores • Composite Proficiency Rate • Cognition (e.g., abstract reasoning, concept formation, critical thinking, executive function skills, general problem solving, logical thinking, memory, metacognition, spatial ability, symbolic learning, and IQ.); • Other (please specify)
Emerging Bilingual	**Proficiency in English language acquisition, comprehension, and fluency.** • Proficiency in the English Language • Proficiency in a Language other than English • Other (please specify)
School Attendance and Progress	**Measures related to secondary and post-secondary school preparedness, performance, and retention.** • College Readiness • Progressing in Secondary School • School Attendance (e.g., attendance rates, absenteeism, tardiness) • Staying in Secondary School • Dropout • High School Completion (e.g., credit recovery/deficiency) • College enrollment (e.g., applying to, enrolling in, or attending a postsecondary institution, such as applying for financial aid, actual enrollment in college, number or selectivity of admitted institutions, enrollment by institution type, full-time vs. part-time enrollment, and immediate vs. delayed enrollment)
Physical Health	**Non-academic measures related to student physical well-being.** • BMI • Time spent outside • Any other physical activity
Mathematics Achievement	**What they have learned in school. Assessments and grades to determine proficiency in Mathematics related subjects.** • Algebra Achievement • Geometry Achievement • General Math Achievement • SAT/ACT Math Scores • Standardized Math test (including state, national or other) • Math Proficiency Rate • Math Course Grades (including pass or fail)

Domain name (Macro-construct)	Construct name and description (Micro-construct)
Kindergarten Academic Readiness	**These constructs relate to preparedness to be in kindergarten. All achievement for pre-school samples will be coded with this macro-construct.** • General Academic Readiness (computational thinking; expressive communication; functional skills; numbers and operation) • Phonics and related awareness (Letter identification, phonemic awareness, phonics, phonological awareness, spelling, and print awareness for the English language) • Proficiency in the English language (Alphabetics, Reading Fluency) • Vocabulary • Reading Comprehension • Writing Conventions (word usage, syntax/sentence structure, grammar, morphology/word inflections, language mechanics/capitalization and punctuation, handwriting quality, and spelling) • Writing Quality (Writing effective, clear, well-organized text in English, such as narrative, informative, persuasive, or creative writing, including poetry) • Receptive communication

Search Strategy and Results

Databases Searched

Traditional Databases

Via EBSCO

Academic Search Premier, Education Research Complete, Education Source, Education Resource Information Center (ERIC), APA PsycInfo, SocINDEX with Full Text.

Covid and Educational Equity (CEE) Project

We also took advantage of a project focusing on COVID and impacts on equity, which is also housed at AIR and led by the same PI (Susan Theriault). The search strategy for that project is included in Appendix A. After merging CEE search results with the results of the traditional database search for this project, we de-duplicated the dataset to ensure that each abstract was only screened once.

Non-traditional data sources

Below is a table presenting the non-traditional data sources and website links. This list may be expanded throughout the project.

Table 2. Non-traditional data sources

Topic	Name	Website(s)
National Resources		
ESSER Spending	Department of Education ESSER Applications by state	https://oese.ed.gov/offices/education-stabilization-fund/elementary-secondary-school-emergency-relief-fund/stateplans/
Council of Chief State School Officers	Learning CCSSO	https://learning.ccsso.org/states-leading-how-state-education-agencies-are-leveraging-the-esser-set-aside
Impacts of Recovery Activities	CALDER/CEPR/NWEA	https://caldercenter.org/covid-recovery
RESTART Network Partners (source of publications other than own websites)		
California	Council of the Great City Schools	https://www.cgcs.org/
	Public Policy Institute of California, University of CA – Berkeley	https://www.ppic.org/
Chicago, IL	UChicago Consortium on School Research	https://consortium.uchicago.edu/
Georgia	Georgia Policy Labs, Georgia State University	https://gpl.gsu.edu/
North Carolina	Education Policy Initiative at Carolina (EPIC), University of North Carolina	https://epic.unc.edu/
Research institutes and Think Tank Resources		
	Annenberg Institute for School Reform at Brown University Research for Recovery	https://www.edresearchforaction.org/
	American Institutes for Research	https://www.air.org/
	Education Recovery Scorecard	https://cepr.harvard.edu/education-recovery-scorecard
	Social Policy Research Associates	https://www.spra.com/
	What Works Clearinghouse Reviewed Studies	https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Reviewedstudies#/OnlyStudiesWithPositiveEffects:false,SetNumber:1

Topic	Name	Website(s)
Other resources		
	Guiding schools' COVID-19 recovery decisions using data and evidence	https://www.edresearchforaction.org/
	Center for Reinventing Public Education	https://crpe.org/
	National Association of Elementary School Principals	https://www.naesp.org/
	School Superintendents Association	https://www.aasa.org/
	CASEL	https://casel.org/
	Social Science Research	https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/DisplayAbstractSearch.cfm
	Registry of Efficacy & Effectiveness studies (REES)	https://sreereg.icpsr.umich.edu/sreereg/
	Campbell Systematic Reviews	https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/
	Open Sciences Framework (OSF)	https://osf.io/search/
	Future Forward for Ohio, University of Ohio Department of Education	https://education.ohio.gov/Topics/Future-Forward-Ohio
	Strategy, Evaluation and Learning (StEL) Team, Puget Sound Educational Service District	https://strategy.psesd.org/
	The Center for Law and Social Policy	https://www.clasp.org/

Search String Terms

Table 2 below represents the search string terms identified by team, advisory board and through our initial scoping review. Search terms will be individualized to the specific database due to database-specific descriptors (i.e. a different search string for ERIC than for PsychInfo, both searched on the EBSCO platform). This search will draw from the thesauri from each database and will be reviewed by AIR's research librarian, Liz Scalia.

Table 3. Keywords for traditional Search

COVID	Sample Age	Needs/Activities
Covid-19	child*	Learning Gap
Covid	adolescen*	Learning loss
pandemic	preadolescen*	*Education Policy*
coronavirus	pre-adolescen*	education disparit*
Covid 19	preteen*	*(Recovery AND education)*
	teen*	*(Intervention AND education)*
	boy*	*ESSER*
	girl*	Education* Gap
	preschool	Lost learning time
	prekindergart*	
	preK, pre-K, pre-K12, pre-K-12, PK-12, K12, K-12*	
	kindergart*	
	school*	
	education	
	elementary-aged	
	primary education	
	elementary	
	middle school	
	high school	
	junior high	
	secondary education	
	secondary-aged	
	grade*	
	classroom*	

Note. Italicized terms are unique to activity artifacts; The * (asterisk) items indicate in Boolean search engines that the word of phrase can end with any other letters (e.g., singular, plural, or past tense). For instance, child* would be inclusive of child, children, and classroom* would be inclusive of classroom and classrooms, but not a phrase starting with classroom, like "classroom setting".

Traditional Database Search and Screening Strategy

Identification of Keywords

We will identify the search terms through iterative development and testing process that aims to balance comprehensiveness and feasibility in four steps.

1. Start with naïve search based on established key terms identified and reviewed by Task 2 research team and network partners.

2. Use initial list to conduct initial scoping review in each traditional database, and screen a certain percentage of studies using Abstrackr to ensure that results are representative of differences between Needs vs. Activities, and variation in qualitative and quantitative activity artifacts.

3. Use the *litsearchr* R package (Grames, Stillman, Tingley, & Elphick, 2019) to identify common terms from the titles and abstracts of eligible studies from our scoping review. To use litsearchr, you begin with a "naïve" search or scoping review. The package is able to identify which keywords are associated with articles. After a team member indicates which articles meet eligibility requirements, it is possible to identify which keywords were associated with hits and which omitted keywords might produce a more favorable search result. Finally, once the keywords are optimized, litsearchr can output search terms specific to each database for the team to copy and paste into the database platform(s).

4. Refine search terms based on litsearchr results for the final list of search terms for the full initial review. While this list is specific for the traditional database search, we will reference the final list when searching non-traditional databases.

Screening Procedures for Traditional Database Search Results

We will screen citations in three stages.

1. In Stage 1 (abstract review), screeners will examine titles and abstracts using the screening tool Abstrackr to help facilitate and manage this initial review (Rathbone, Hoffmann, & Glasziou, 2015); screeners will exclude artifacts only if they are certain that it does not meet at least one inclusion criterion. Screeners will also classify studies as a) need artifact, b) activity artifact, c) need and activity artifact, or d) ineligible. If determined eligible, artifacts will be entered into the AirTable documentation database and tagged for particular fields.

2. In Stage 2 (full text review), screeners will thoroughly examine the full text against the inclusion criteria and determine final status into three possible categorizations of artifact type (needs, activities, needs and activities). The full-text screening process will be conducted in AirTable where all saved documents or pdfs will be stored. Full-text screening will be inclusive of additional key questions/variables that will have two purposes: 1) inform prioritization of studies to be coded in the MetaReviewer and 2) to populate state-level profiles for the Need Sensing Survey. Artifacts deemed eligible at full text screening will be imported into a meta-reviewer database, which will include all citation information for linking at the study level.

3. In Stage 3 (final screening by senior team members), senior team members will review study and determine any links among studies as well as final categorization into artifact type.

Deduplication Procedures

Deduplication and linking of studies will be especially important in this scan: it is very likely to find two or more reports of the same need/activity. We will need to combine automated identification of potential duplicates with careful review by a senior research team member at each stage: importing, after abstract screening, and again after full-text screening. Commonly, evidence synthesists use a common author and/or title to identify duplicates. In this case, automated searches within a common LEA/SEA may be the easiest way to identify potential duplicates or linked reports.

Final Search String for Traditional Databases

This will be created using the R-package *litsearchr* which automatically create the string to be used in our scans of the various databases. This process is detailed in the Overview of Search and Screening Strategy section above.

EBSCO

February 23, 2023

(KW (covid-19 OR covid OR "covid 19" OR pandemic OR coronavirus) OR TI (covid-19 OR "covid 19" OR covid OR pandemic OR coronavirus) OR AB (covid-19 OR "covid 19" OR covid OR pandemic OR coronavirus)) AND (KW (child* OR adolescen* OR preadolescen* OR pre-adolescen* OR preteen* OR teen* OR boy* OR girl* OR preschool OR prekindergart* OR preK OR pre-K OR pre-K12 OR pre-K-12 OR PK-12 OR K12 OR K-12* OR kindergart* OR school* OR education OR elementary-aged OR "primary education" OR elementary OR "middle school" OR "high school" OR "secondary education" OR "junior high" OR secondary-aged OR grade* OR classroom*) OR TI (child* OR adolescen* OR preadolescen* OR pre-adolescen* OR preteen* OR teen* OR boy* OR girl* OR preschool OR prekindergart* OR preK OR pre-K OR pre-K12 OR pre-K-12 OR PK-12 OR K12 OR K-12* OR kindergart* OR school* OR education OR elementary-aged OR "primary education" OR elementary OR "middle school" OR "high school" OR "secondary education" OR "junior high" OR secondary-aged OR grade* OR classroom*) OR AB (child* OR adolescen* OR preadolescen* OR pre-adolescen* OR preteen* OR teen* OR boy* OR girl* OR preschool OR prekindergart* OR preK OR pre-K OR pre-K12 OR pre-K-12 OR PK-12 OR K12 OR K-12* OR kindergart* OR school* OR education OR elementary-aged OR "primary education" OR elementary OR "middle school" OR "high school" OR "secondary education" OR "junior high" OR secondary-aged OR grade* OR classroom*)) AND (KW("Learning Gap" OR "Education* Gap" OR "Learning loss" OR "Education Policy" OR "education disparit*" OR (education AND recovery) OR (education AND Intervention) OR ESSER) OR AB ("Learning Gap" OR "Education* Gap" OR "Learning loss" OR "Education Policy" OR "education disparit*" OR (education AND recovery) OR (education AND Intervention) OR ESSER) OR TI(

"Learning Gap" OR "Education* Gap" OR "Learning loss" OR "Education Policy" OR "education disparit*" OR (education AND recovery) OR (education AND Intervention) OR ESSER))

Limitations: Date range 2020–Present
ENGLISH ONLY
Search Results: 3,723

EBSCO

Planned August, 2023
(KW (covid-19 OR covid OR "covid 19" OR pandemic OR coronavirus) OR TI (covid-19 OR "covid 19" OR covid OR pandemic OR coronavirus) OR AB (covid-19 OR "covid 19" OR covid OR pandemic OR coronavirus)) AND (KW (child* OR adolescen* OR preadolescen* OR pre-adolescen* OR preteen* OR teen* OR boy* OR girl* OR preschool OR prekindergart* OR preK OR pre-K OR pre-K12 OR pre-K-12 OR PK-12 OR K12 OR K-12* OR kindergart* OR school* OR education OR elementary-aged OR "primary education" OR elementary OR "middle school" OR "high school" OR "secondary education" OR "junior high" OR secondary-aged OR grade* OR classroom*) OR TI (child* OR adolescen* OR preadolescen* OR pre-adolescen* OR preteen* OR teen* OR boy* OR girl* OR preschool OR prekindergart* OR preK OR pre-K OR pre-K12 OR pre-K-12 OR PK-12 OR K12 OR K-12* OR kindergart* OR school* OR education OR elementary-aged OR "primary education" OR elementary OR "middle school" OR "high school" OR "secondary education" OR "junior high" OR secondary-aged OR grade* OR classroom*) OR AB (child* OR adolescen* OR preadolescen* OR pre-adolescen* OR preteen* OR teen* OR boy* OR girl* OR preschool OR prekindergart* OR preK OR pre-K OR pre-K12 OR pre-K-12 OR PK-12 OR K12 OR K-12* OR kindergart* OR school* OR education OR elementary-aged OR "primary education" OR elementary OR "middle school" OR "high school" OR "secondary education" OR "junior high" OR secondary-aged OR grade* OR classroom*)) AND (KW("Learning Gap" OR "Education* Gap" OR "Lost Learning Time" OR" Learning loss" OR "Education Policy" OR "education disparit*" OR (education AND recovery) OR (education AND Intervention) OR ESSER) OR AB ("Learning Gap" OR "Lost Learning Time" OR "Education* Gap" OR "Learning loss" OR "Education Policy" OR "education disparit*" OR (education AND recovery) OR (education AND Intervention) OR ESSER) OR TI("Learning Gap" OR "Education* Gap" OR "Lost Learning Time" "Learning loss" OR "Education Policy" OR "education disparit*" OR (education AND recovery) OR (education AND Intervention) OR ESSER))

New term additions
Limitations: Date range February 2023–Present
ENGLISH ONLY
Search Results: XXXX

Total Citations Retrieved from Search on 2/23/23

Academic Search Premier = 1,494
Education Research Complete = 0
Education Source = 700
ERIC = 541
APA PsycInfo = 503
SocINDEX with Full Text = 86
EBSCO Total = 3,324
ESBCO Total after filtering out "foreign countries" = 3,259
Covid and Educational Equity (CEE) search = 866
EBSCO +CEE Total = 4,125
Duplicates based on title alone = 562
Total after removing duplicates = 3,563

Total exported to Abstrackr Database = 3,563

Non-Traditional/Gray Literature Search and Screening Strategy

During the initial search, we will establish a system to document the search process and results from non-traditional and gray literature source. However, the first round of searching will omit non-traditional search results from the synthesis. Nontraditional search results will be integrated starting in round 2. Each source website will be entered into an AirTable form and the following variables will be completed during each scan:

1. Unique ID for search
2. Website Acronym + Date
3. Non-Traditional Source Name:
4. What is the date(s) the search was performed?
5. Does source website have search function?**
   a. If yes, please indicate if the search functionality allows for Boolean search terms?
   b. If yes, what search terms are used?
6. Were particular pages on the source website examined for artifacts?
   a. If yes, which pages?
   b. Provide details such as titles/sections of the website for each source
7. Number of search results from this page
8. Number of potentially relevant results
9. Final approval for inclusion (senior team member reviewer only)
10. Link/upload to document management database to upload pdfs of potentially relevant results n (senior team member reviewer only)

**Whenever possible, we will use the full Boolean search strings applied to the traditional databases. When the search functionality does not allow this, the following search terms will be used individually for data sources that do not have advanced search functionality: COVID, pandemic, education recovery, learning loss. All results should be sorted by date, if possible, and all results should be reviewed. If no search option is available on a given data source, all website pages in the data source should be examined with an important focus on pages that include resources, reports, or other key findings promoted by or created by each data source.

The nontraditional search will retrieve only artifacts that seem to meet our abstract criteria from the information available on the search page (often this is the title, keywords, date of publication and abstract, thought at times abstracts may be omitted). The searcher will utilize the same abstract screening criteria as screeners use in the abstract screening stage for traditional databases.

1. **Country**: Was the study conducted in the United States and is focused on the US Education System?

    a. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    b. No—stop screening

2. **COVID-19 Recovery:** Is the study focused on COVID-19 Educational Recovery?

    a. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    b. No—stop screening

3. **Education/Learning Related?**

    a. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    b. No—stop screening

4. **Age**: Is a PK-12 aged population sampled and studied?

    a. Note: If the abstract says both PK-12 and postsecondary students were sampled, then the answer to this question is still Yes.

        i. e.g., study only samples university students or older, then No.

        ii. e.g., study only samples younger than pre-kindergarten students, then No.

    b. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    c. No—stop screening

The process of searching these non-traditional databases requires at least a title screening and often a title and abstract screening of each artifact. So we will consider the completion of Steps 8 and 9 of the AirTable form to comprise the abstract screening process (Stage 1). A senior team member will conduct an abstract screen to confirm eligibility and upload of any non-traditional data source that meets screening criteria to the AirTable document management database. If the senior team member agrees with the eligibility of identified documents, these documents will also be added to the MetaRevieweR database for coding (Stage 3).

Additional Searching

- Reference harvesting specific systematic reviews and meta-analyses

- Direct email with study advisors and high-profile authors

- Backward & Forward citation searching of included studies

  - We will use the R-based program paperfetcher to supplement our backward and forward citation searching. This tool is a web application (Pallath & Zhang, 2022) that automates citation searching and relies on the database of academic content of Crossref. Crossref is an official DOI registration agency and as of May 2021, the database contains more than1.3 published and unpublished content (e.g., journals, books, conference proceedings, dissertations, working papers).

Backward citation searching of articles screened out at abstract and full text stage, which seemed to have relevant citations

Auxiliary Search—Citations found outside of the systematic search

- Reference

  - Method of identification/locating

  - Date of identification

Repetition of Literature Scan

After our initial scan of traditional and non-traditional/grey literature databases, we will repeat the same scan process every 3 to 4 months. This ensures that the final product will be comprehensive of all recovery needs and activity artifacts to date. The procedures to search the traditional and non-traditional databases will be followed and results of all scans will be documented. Again, the identification of duplicate and linked studies will be equally as important when conducting the repeat scans. Details on their identification will be well documented.

Abstract Screening Strategy and Results

Initial Screening Question

The following four initial screening questions will help the process of weeding out studies based on key inclusion/exclusion criteria for both the needs and activity studies. All abstracts were dual screened to ensure accuracy.

Note: meta-analyses, research synthesis, literature reviews are ineligible for inclusion

1. **Country**: Was the study conducted in the United States and is focused on the US Education System?

Note: We will exclude all international studies, including those that are involving multiple countries including the US. All included studies should focus on US locations (e.g., City, State, Multi-state)

    a. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    b. No—stop screening

2. **COVID-19 Recovery:** Is the study focused on COVID-19 Educational Recovery?
   Note: Check that the phrase associated with COVID is not related to a study evaluating data PRIOR to the pandemic acknowledgement date of March 2020. For instance, studies evaluating pre-pandemic student performance.

    a. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    b. No—stop screening

3. **Age**: Is a PK-12 aged population sampled and studied?

    a. Note: If the abstract says both PK-12 and postsecondary students were sampled, then the answer to this question is still Yes.

        i. e.g., study only samples university students or older, then No.

        ii. e.g., study only samples younger than pre-kindergarten students, then No.

    b. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    c. No—stop screening

4. **Education/Learning Related?**

    a. Yes or Unsure/Unclear—continue screening

    b. No—stop screening

5. **Is this a literature scan, systematic review, research synthesis, or meta-analysis?**

    a. Yes and in abstrackr tag this as a Review, and mark as ineligible.

    b. No—ruled eligible

Abstract Screening Results

As a result of the abstract screening process for EBSCO and the CEE references, we screened a total of **3,563** abstracts, and determine that **1,198** were eligible and proceeded to the full-text screening process.

Full-Text Retrieval

Total citations to locate: 1,201[1]

Total citations found: 1,136

Citations not found: 65

Full-Text Screening Strategy and Results

Full-Text Screening Questions

The following screening questions will be used to further assess eligibility when screening the full text:

1. **Country**: Was the study conducted in the United States and is focused on the US Education System?
   Note: We will exclude all international studies, including those that are involving multiple countries including the US. All included studies should focus on US locations (e.g., City, State, Multi-state)

   a. Yes

   b. No—stop screening

2. **Is this a literature scan, systematic review, research synthesis, or meta-analysis?**

   a. Yes - stop screening

   b. No

3. **Is this an auto-ethnography, essay, media report, opinion editorial (op-ed), or memo?**

   a. Yes—stop screening

   b. No

4. **Setting**: Is the study related to PK-12?

   a. Note: If the abstract says both PK-12 and postsecondary students were sampled, then the answer to this question is still Yes.

      i. e.g., study only samples university students or older, then No.

      ii. e.g., study only samples younger than pre-kindergarten students, then No.

   b. Yes

   c. No—stop screening

---

[1] As screening progressed and additional citations were located, we included those in the full text screening process. This is why there are slightly more articles for full text retrieval than came from the abstract screening results.

5. **COVID-19 Recovery:** Is the study focused on COVID-19 Educational Recovery?
   Note: Check that the phrase associated with COVID is not related to a study evaluating data PRIOR to the pandemic acknowledgement date of March 2020. For instance, studies evaluating pre-pandemic student performance.

   a. Yes

   b. No—stop screening

6. **School Setting:** Is the state or school district involved in the study or in a strategy, activity or intervention? (If unclear, select Yes)
   Note: Homeschool and private schools excluded
   - Yes
   - No—stop screening

7. **Does the study relate to an educational strategy, activity, or intervention?**

   a. Yes

   b. No—stop screening

8. **Does at least one study intervention activity fall into one of these broad priority categories (Select all that apply) (see details in table)?**

   a. Yes, Literacy

   b. Yes, Math

   c. Yes, Social or Emotional Learning

   d. Yes, Accelerated Learning

   e. Yes, Tutoring

   f. Yes, Summer School/After School/Out of School Time

   g. Yes, Teacher Training or Teacher Outcomes

   h. **No—Stop screening**

9. **For eligible reports only, how many activities are described or evaluated in the report?**
   [restrict to integer]

10. **Notes**

Table 4. Screener Guidance for Determining Study Eligibility

Term	Definition	Synonyms/Examples
Literacy Curriculum	Implements an activity targeting literacy outcomes	Reading, English, ELA, Language Arts,
Math Curriculum	Implements an activity targeting math outcomes	Numeracy, Mathematics, Addition, Geometry.
Social or Emotional learning (SEL) Curriculum	Implements an activity related to social or emotional learning, student motivation, engagement, belonging and school climate	Mental Health, Mental Wellness, Relationships, Anxiety/Depression, Motivation, Emotions, Belongingness, School Climate
Accelerated Learning Program	Implements an activity that enables students to progress through school at a faster rate	
Tutoring Program	Implements an activity to provide any type of tutoring or one on one instruction.	Peer tutoring, one on one instruction, high dosage tutoring
Summer School /School Extension/After-School Programs		Out of School Time (OST)
Teacher Training or Educator Supports	Teacher pipeline (Pre-service and in-service training) or addressing teacher shortages or making sure they have the resources they need	Hiring is an eligible activity

Full-Text Bucketing Questions

The responses should be answered for each of the activities deemed eligible in the full-text screening process. For eligible reports with multiple activities, each activity will have a separate activity identifier and data will be entered separately by activity identifier.

1. Which topic does the activity relate to?

    a. Literacy Curriculum

    b. Math Curriculum

    c. Social Emotional Learning (SEL)

    d. Accelerated Learning

    e. Tutoring Program

    f. Summer School, School extension, or After-School Program

    g. Teacher Training, Outcomes, or Other Educator Support

2. What State/States are associated? [Select all that apply from list of states/territories]

3. What grade level is the sample for this activity (Check all that apply)

   a. PreK/Childcare

   b. Elementary: Kindergarten-Grade 5

   c. Middle: Grade 6-8

   d. High: Grade 9-12

4. Which funding stream(s) were used to fund this activity? (Check all that apply)

   a. COVID ESSER funds?

   b. Student Opportunity Act funds?

   c. Foundation grant funds?

   d. State/local budgets?

   e. Other federal/state grants?

   f. Other sources mentioned?

   g. Unknown

5. What is the target population? (Check all that apply)

   a. Unhoused/Homeless

   b. Emerging Bilingual (ELL)

   c. Black/African American students

   d. Asian American/ Pacific Island students (AAPI)

   e. Latinx/Hispanic students

   f. Native American / Alaskan native students

   g. LGBTQ Students

   h. Students with Disabilities and/or Students receiving special education services (504 or IEPs)

   i. Refugee students

   j. Students in foster care

   k. Students with FRPL/Low Socio-economic status

   l. Students performing below grade level (in any subject))

   m. No specific target population

   n. Other (Please Specify)

6. What is the timeframe of the identified need or activity? (Check all that apply)

   a. Spring 2020

    b. Summer 2020

    c. Fall 2020

    d. Winter 2021

    e. Spring 2021

    f. Summer 2021

    g. Fall 2021

    h. Winter 2022

    i. Spring 2022

    j. Summer 2022

    k. Fall 2022

    l. Winter 2023

    m. Spring 2023

7. Does the report describe any planned evaluation of this activity?

    a. No

    b. Yes

8. Does the report discuss any effectiveness or progress of this activity?

    a. No

    b. Yes

9. Notes

Provide any additional details for any of the above questions (identified by question #) or any important information.

Full-Text Screening Results

Studies Screened from Original Search:

Studies Kept:

Studies Dropped:

Additional Eligible Studies Found through Auxiliary Searches:

Total Studies to Code:

Full-Text Coding

Total citations to code:

Total citations found:

Citations not found, reasons:

Table 5. 01_Citation

Variable Name	Description	Format
StudyID	Linking ID for multiple reports on same study within the dataset *(Note: Study ID should include a data source prefix)*	Numeric
CitationID	Unique ID for single report/file *Prefix: ER-ERIC/PS-PsychInfo/GL-grey literature*	Text
Citation*	APA style citation of article	Text
PubDate*	Publication Date (Month and Year)	Text
PubType*	Publication type	Categorical
	Whole book	
	Book chapter	
	Conference presentation/paper	
	Journal article	
	Report	
	Thesis/dissertation	
	Unpublished manuscript/data	
	Online website	
	Other	
PubTypeOth*	Publication type - Other, specify	Text
StaffID	Staff ID	Categorical
	Kelisa Cain	
	Tia Clinton	
	Rebecca Steingut	
	Melissa Rodgers	
	Madeline Polese	
	Crystal London	
	Ilana Barach	
	Maria Dracopoli	
Coding_Status	Coding completion status	Categorical
	NOT ASSIGNED (NA)	
	NOT STARTED (NS), but assigned	
	IN PROGRESS (IP): started	

Variable Name	Description	Format
	HALT (H): need input from review team before further coding (specify in overall notes)	
	DON'T CODE (DC): ineligible after closer review (specify in overall notes)	
	AUTHOR QUERY (AQ): need information from authors before further coding (specify in overall notes)	
	DUPLICATE (DP): should merge with a different ID (specify in overall notes) and not code under this ID	
	CONNECTED REPORT (CR): supplemental materials that are linked to Main artifact (So not coded under this ID) Please specify Main Study ID:	
	DOUBLE CHECK (DC): finished but specific fields should be checked (specify in overall notes)	
	DONE (D): finished with no further questions	
	DONE AND RECONCILED (DR): entries have been reconciled (dual coded) or QA'ed (single coded)	
Overall_Notes	Overall notes	Text

*Note: this information will be auto-populated with details from the linked citation database in Meta-Reviewer. Information will be downloaded for all artifacts deemed eligible in AirTable during full-text screening.

Table 6. 02_Target_Pop_Setting

Variable Name	Description	Format
TP_Set_ID	Target Population and Setting ID *(Note: Allows Single Citation to present multiple target setting and populations)*	Text
TP_State	Name of State (Dropdown of States)	Categorical
NCES_ID	NCES ID	Text
SEA_Name	State Education Agency (SEA) Name	Text
SEA_Region	SEA Region	Categorical
	West South Northeast Midwest	
District_Name	District Name	Text

Variable Name	Description	Format
LEA_Name	Local Education Agency (LEA) Name	Text
LEA_Distr_Size	Approximate number of students served in LEA/District	Numeric
LEA_Distr_Size	Approximate number of students served in LEA/District	Numeric
LEA_Urbanicity	Urbanicity at LEA/District Level	Categorical
	Urban Rural Suburban Mixed	
RESTART_Team	RESTART Research Team linked?	Boolean
	Yes No	
TP_GradeCat	Grade Category (Check all that apply)	Categorical
	Pre-K Elementary (K-5) Middle school (6-8) High school (9-12)	
TP_Grade	Grade (Check all that apply)	Categorical
	Pre-K (3s) Pre-K (4s) Kindergarten 1st grade 2nd grade 3rd grade 4th grade 5th grade 6th grade 7th grade 8th grade 9th grade 10th grade 11th grade 12th grade	

Variable Name	Description	Format
TP_Pop	Indicate Descriptive of Student Target Population *(Check all that apply)*	Categorical

	Under reported minority (URM), please specify:
	    Black/African American
	    Latinx/Hispanic students
	    Asian American/Pacific Islander (AAPI)
	    Native American/Alaskan Native
	LGBTQ Students
	Male students
	Female students
	Students with Disabilities (504 or IEPs)
	Unhoused/Homeless students
	Refugee students
	Students who are ELs
	Students in foster care
	Students with FRPL/Low Socio-economic status
	Students performing before grade level (in any subject)
	No specific target population
	Other (Please Specify)	

TP_Setting	Indicate Descriptive of Target School or Other Setting *(Check all that apply)*	
	Title 1 Schools Comprehensive Support and Improvement (CSI) School(s) Targeted Support and Improvement (TSI) School(s) Other	
TP_urban	Indicate if Urbanicity Type is Target School or Other Setting	
	Urban Rural Suburban Mixed	

Variable Name	Description	Format
TP_Time	Please indicate the date and timeframe for the identified need or activity. (Select all season and years that apply)	Categorical
	Spring 2020 Summer 2020 Fall 2020 Winter 2021 Spring 2021 Summer 2021 Fall 2021 Winter 2022 Spring 2022 Summer 2022 Fall 2022 Winter 2023 Spring 2023 Summer 2023 … etc. for rest of grant.	
TP_notes	Notes on Target Population	

Table 7. 03_Needs_and_Outcomes

Variable Name	Description	Format
Need_Descrip	General description of need that lead to the identification of activities.	Text
Outcome_marco	Macro Outcome Domains (Select all that apply)	Categorical
	Kindergarten Academic Readiness English Achievement Math Achievement General Achievement Emerging Bilingual School Attendance & Progress Social-Emotional Learning, Behavioral & Mental Health Motivation Belonging/School Climate Physical Health Teacher Outcomes Other	
	If other, please specify	Text

Variable Name	Description	Format
Outcome_Desc	Detailed Macro Outcome Descriptions	Text
Outcome_micro	Target Variable (Micro) *(Note: We have identified an initial list of Micro constructs for each macro-construct in the protocol which we will include in the database).*	

	Kindergarten Academic Readiness
	    General Readiness
	    Phonics and Related Awareness
	    Proficiency in English Language
	    Vocabulary
	    Reading Comprehension
	    Writing Conventions
	    Writing Quality
	    Receptive Communication
	English Achievement
	    SAT/ACT English Scores
	    SAT/ACT Written Scores
	    Standardized ELA tests (including state, national or other)
	    English/Writing Proficiency Rate (at grade, school etc.)
	    ELA Course Grades (including pass or fail)
	Math Achievement
	    Algebra Achievement Test
	    Geometry Achievement Test
	    General Math Achievement
	    SAT/ACT Math Scores
	    Standardized Math tests (including state, national or other)
	    Math Proficiency Rate (at grade, school etc.)
	    Math Course Grades (including pass or fail)
	General Achievement
	    GPA
	    SAT/ACT Composite Scores
	    Composite Proficiency Rate
	    Cognition
	    Other (please specify)
	Emerging Bilingual
	    Proficiency in the English Language
	    Proficiency in a Language other than English
	    Other (please specify)	

Variable Name	Description	Format
	School Attendance & Progress	
	College Readiness	
	Progressing in Secondary School	
	School Attendance	
	Staying in Secondary School	
	Dropout	
	High School Completion	
	College enrollment	
	Social-Emotional Learning, Behavioral, & Mental Health	
	Functional Skills	
	Socio-emotional skills	
	Student Behavior	
	Student Discipline	
	Anti-social behavior	
	Substance use/abuse	
	Mental health (e.g., depression, anxiety, loneliness)	
	Motivation	
	Motivational Beliefs	
	Motivation Value	
	Positive emotions	
	Negative emotions	
	Motivation Identity	
	Motivation Competence	
	Engagement	
	Belonging/School Climate	
	Quality of social interactions,	
	Safety	
	Sense of belonging (school bonding), including sense of alienation	
	Perceptions of school climate	
	Teacher expectations	
	Teacher support	
	Student/teacher relationships	
	Peer relationships	
	Parental involvement	
	Physical Health	
	BMI	
	Time spent outside	

Variable Name	Description	Format
	Any other physical activity	
	Teacher Outcomes	
	Teaching Skills and Techniques to improve Teaching Remotely	
	Teacher Self-Efficacy	
	Teacher Retention	
	Teacher well-being	
	Teacher Attendance	
	Teacher practice	
Outcome_Notes	Notes on Outcomes	

Table 8. 04_Activity_Specifics

Variable Name	Description	Format
Act_ID_[1…X]	Unique ID for single activity from this study	Text
PArea_[1…X]	Priority Area (Check all that apply to this activity) *(Please indicate only the priority area related to this specific activity.)*	Categorical
	Literacy Curriculum Social or Emotional Learning Curriculum Accelerated Learning Program Tutoring Program Summer School/School Extension/After-School Programs Teacher Training or Educator Supports	Categorical
TP_Set_ID	Target Population and Setting ID *(Note: Insert ID linked to Target and setting ID from 02 Table)*	Text
Specific Activity Sample *(Please complete the following specific details if it is more than what is described on the Target Population and Setting Page for this specific outcome)*		
Sp_Act_Time_[1…X]	Please indicate the date and timeframe for the identified activity. (Check all that apply)	Categorical
	Spring 2020 Summer 2020 Fall 2020 Winter 2021 Spring 2021	

Variable Name	Description	Format
	Summer 2021	
	Fall 2021	
	Winter 2022	
	Spring 2022	
	Summer 2022	
	Fall 2022	
	Winter 2023	
	Spring 2023	
	Summer 2023 ... etc. for rest of grant.	

Based on the targeted level of need above, provide the estimates of the following categories if stated in the article.

Variable Name	Description	Format
Pct_Woman_[1...X]	Percent sample self-identifies as Woman	Numeric
Pct_Man_[1...X]	Percent sample self-identifies as Man	Numeric
Pct_Nonbinary_[1...X]	Percent sample self-identifies as Nonbinary	Numeric
Pct_White_[1...X]	Percent sample White, non-Hispanic	Numeric
Pct_Black_AA_[1...X]	Percent sample Black or African American	Numeric
Pct_A_Ind_Alask_[1...X]	Percent sample American Indian or Alaska Native	Numeric
Pct_AAPI_[1...X]	Percent sample Asian American / Pacific Islander	Numeric
Pct_Latinx_PI_[1...X]	Percent sample Lantinx / Hispanic students	Numeric
Pct_MultiRace_[1...X]	Percent sample Multi-racial	Numeric
Pct_OtherRace_[1...X]	Percent sample Other race	Numeric
Pct_UnknownRace_[1...X]	Percent sample Race unknown	Numeric
Pct_BIPOC_[1...X]	Percent black or indigenous people of color and/or racial-ethnic minority, if authors reported an aggregated %	Numeric
Pct_LGBTQ_[1...X]	Percentage of students that identify LGBTQ	Numeric
Pct_IEPs_[1...X]	Percentage of students with Disabilities (IEPs or 508)	Numeric
Pct_unhoused_[1...X]	Percentage of students experiencing homelessness	Numeric
Pct_Refugees_[1...X]	Percentage of students who are refugees	Numeric
Pct_EL_[1...X]	Percentage of students who are English learners	Numeric
Pct_Foster_[1...X]	Percentage of students in foster care	Numeric
Pct_FRPL_[1...X]	Percentage qualifying for free and reduced price lunch	Numeric
MathProfLevel_[1...X]	Percent at specified math proficiency levels	
	Meets standards ___%	Numeric

Variable Name	Description	Format
	Exceeds standards___%	Numeric
	Other ___ %	Numeric
	Other Description	Text
MathProfOther_[1...X]	Describe level	Text
ELAProfLevel_[1...X]	Percent at specified ELA proficiency levels	
	Meets standards ___%	Numeric
	Exceeds standards___%	Numeric
	Other ___ %	Numeric
	Other Description	Text
ELAProfOther_[1...X]	Describe level	Text

Activity Setting

(Please complete the following descriptive information for the activity setting.)

Variable Name	Description	Format
Act_descrip_[1...X]	Provide a Brief (1-2 sentences) Description of Activity	Text
Act_Level_[1...X]	Level of Activity Identified (Select all that apply)	Categorical
	Student Teachers (Including special education) Support Staff (counselors, interventionists, coaches, para-professionals) School leadership School board/district leadership Community Parent/family Other	
Act_Level_Other_[1...X]	If other, please specify	Text
Act_Level_Sttng_[1...X]	Setting Level of Activity	Categorical
	State District/LEA School Other	
	If other, please specify	Text
Act_SchoolStatus_[1...X]	School Open at time of Activity	Boolean
	Open Closed	

Variable Name	Description	Format
Act_InstrMode_[1...X]	Instructional Mode at time of Activity	Categorical
	Remote In-person Hybrid	
School_Size_[1...X]	Approximate number of students served in School	Numeric
LEA_Distr_Size_[1...X]	Approximate number of students served in LEA/District	Numeric

Activity Specific Outcomes

(Provide details about the specific needs and outcomes related to this activity)

Variable Name	Description	Format
Need_		
Sp_Outcome_marco_[1...X]	Macro Outcome Domains (Select all that apply)	Categorical
	Kindergarten Academic Readiness English Achievement Math Achievement General Achievement Emerging Bilingual School Attendance & Progress Social-Emotional Learning, Behavioral & Mental Health Motivation Belonging/School Climate Physical Health Teacher Outcomes Other	
	If other, please specify	Text
Sp_Outcome_Desc_[1...X]	Detailed Macro Outcome Descriptions	Text
Sp_Outcome_micro_[1...X]	Identify Micro Outcome Variable *(Note: We have identified an initial list of Micro constructs for each macro-construct in the protocol which we will include in the database).*	
	Kindergarten Academic Readiness General Readiness Phonics and Related Awareness Proficiency in English Language Vocabulary Reading Comprehension Writing Conventions	

Variable Name	Description	Format
	Writing Quality	
	Receptive Communication	
	English Achievement	
	SAT/ACT English Scores	
	SAT/ACT Written Scores	
	Standardized ELA tests (including state, national or other)	
	English/Writing Proficiency Rate (at grade, school etc.)	
	ELA Course Grades (including pass or fail)	
	Math Achievement	
	Algebra Achievement Test	
	Geometry Achievement Test	
	General Math Achievement	
	SAT/ACT Math Scores	
	Standardized Math tests (including state, national or other)	
	Math Proficiency Rate (at grade, school etc.)	
	Math Course Grades (including pass or fail)	
	General Achievement	
	GPA	
	SAT/ACT Composite Scores	
	Composite Proficiency Rate	
	Cognition	
	Other (please specify)	
	Emerging Bilingual	
	Proficiency in the English Language	
	Proficiency in a Language other than English	
	Other (please specify)	
	School Attendance & Progress	
	College Readiness	
	Progressing in Secondary School	
	School Attendance	
	Staying in Secondary School	
	Dropout	
	High School Completion	
	College enrollment	
	Social-Emotional Learning, Behavioral, & Mental Health	

Variable Name	Description	Format
	Functional Skills	
	Socio-emotional skills	
	Student Behavior	
	Student Discipline	
	Anti-social behavior	
	Substance use/abuse	
	Mental health (e.g., depression, anxiety, loneliness)	
	Motivation	
	Motivational Beliefs	
	Motivation Value	
	Positive emotions	
	Negative emotions	
	Motivation Identity	
	Motivation Competence	
	Engagement	
	Belonging/School Climate	
	Quality of social interactions,	
	Safety	
	Sense of belonging (school bonding), including sense of alienation	
	Perceptions of school climate	
	Teacher expectations	
	Teacher support	
	Student/teacher relationships	
	Peer relationships	
	Parental involvement	
	Physical Health	
	BMI	
	Time spent outside	
	Any other physical activity	
	Teacher Outcomes	
	Teaching Skills and Techniques to improve Teaching Remotely	
	Teacher Self-Efficacy	
	Teacher Retention	
	Teacher well-being	
	Teacher Attendance	
	Teacher practice	
Additional Planned Study Elements		
Funder_[1...X]	Indicate Targeted/Planned Funder	Text

Variable Name	Description	Format
SEA_Partner_[1...X]	SEA partner or collaborating organizations	Text
LEA_Partner_[1...X]	LEA partner or collaborating organizations	Text
Intend_plans_[1...X]	Any mention of intended plans (e.g., funding, partnerships) to address need?	Boolean
Eval_lead_[1...X]	Evaluation Lead (Check all that apply)	Categorical
	State	
	District/District Staff	
	School (Elementary, Middle, or High School)	
	Research Firm	
	University	
	Other	
	If other, please specify	
Eval_Status_[1...X]	Status of Evaluation	Categorical
	Implementation Level	
	In-progress	
	Complete	
Eval_Timeline_[1...X]	Evaluation Timeline Description	Text
Interim_[1...X]	Are evaluators checking/monitoring implementation?	Boolean
	Yes	
	No or Not Reported	
Error_correct_[1...X]	Are they shifting mid-course to improve fidelity?	Boolean
	Yes	
	No or Not Reported	
Findings_Time_[1...X]	Availability of Findings	Boolean
	Yes	
	No or Not Yet	
Sp_method_indic_[1...X]	Does the activity include specific descriptions of the methods and timeline of an evaluation of the study?	
	Yes	
	No	
Study Methods Details—Evaluation of Activity *(These variables will only appear if the previous questions I indicated as 'Yes, the activity includes specific information about the methods and timelines.')*		
Prgm_Int_Name_[1...X]	Program/Intervention Name	Text

Variable Name	Description	Format
Act_Start_[1...X]	Activity Start Date (Month and Year)	Text
Act_End_[1...X]	Activity End Date (Month and Year)	Text
Act_Time_Desc_[1...X]	Description of Timeline (using Month and Year)	Text
Quant_Method_[1...X]	Quantitative methods to produce estimate of impact?	Boolean
	Yes No	
Eval_Type_[1...X]	Type of Evaluation	Categorical
	Impact Process/Implementation Other	
	If Other, please specify	Text
Design_[1...X]	Study Design (if applicable)	Categorical
	RCT (Individual or Cluster) QED (e.g., pre-post, non-randomized, cohort study) DnD or Regression Discontinuity Single Group (Observational) Other	
	If Other, please specify	Text
Analysis_Type_[1...X]	Type of Analysis (if applicable)	Categorical
	Confirmatory Exploratory Other	
	If Other, please specify	Text
Need_Level_[1...X]	Level of activity identified (Select all that apply)	Categorical
	Student Teachers (Including special education) Support Staff (counselors, interventionists, coaches, para-professionals) School leadership School board/district leadership Community Parent/family Other	

Variable Name	Description	Format
Stake_Org_invld_[1...X]	Stakeholder/Organization involved (Input stakeholders conducted)	Text
Limit_barriers_[1...X]	Limitations: Implementation Barriers	Categorical
	Staff Shortages Student uptake Targeting the right groups of students Community/Parent buy in Other	
	If Other, please describe	
Limit_meth_barriers_[1...X]	Limitations: Methodological Barriers	Categorical
	Missing Data Measurement difficulties (e.g., student engagement/attendance) Selected analytic approach used Other	
	If Other, please describe	
Log_modl_[1...X]	Logic Model or Theory of Change Included? (Tier 4)	Boolean
	Yes No or Not Reported	
Desired/Expected Results		
OutcomeID_[1...X]	Outcome ID	Text
Outcome_var_[1...X]	Outcome Variable (Macro)	Categorical
	Academic Readiness English Achievement Math Achievement General Achievement Emerging Bilingual School Attendance & Progress Social-Emotional Learning, Behavioral & Mental Health Physical Health Teacher Outcomes Other	
	If other, please specify	Text
Outcome_Desc_[1...X]	Outcome Variable Description	Text

Variable Name	Description	Format
Outcome_var_[1...X]	Outcome Variable (Micro) *(Note: We have identified an initial list of Micro constructs for each macro-construct in the protocol which we will include in the database).*	
SS_Type_[1...X]	Indicate if Sample size is randomized (if known) or analytic?	Categorical
	Randomized (Baseline) Analytic	
	Sample Size Information (if reported) *(Note: create a table to capture the provided sample sizes at the district, school and teacher/student level if provided)*	
SS_N_Total_[1...X]	Total Sample Size	Numeric
SS_N_Tx_[1...X]	Treatment Group Sample Size	Numeric
SS_N_Ctrl_[1...X]	Control Group Sample Size	Numeric
ES_Info_Reported_[1...X]	Indicate if quantitative information is reported for this outcome? *(Note: We will revisit studies coded Yes after coding activities and then determine the number of studies that could potentially be coded for a meta-analysis.)*	Boolean
	Yes No Not Reported	
Outcome_Notes_[1...X]	Overall notes for this outcome	Text

Appendix A: Covid and Educational Equity (CEE) Search

Search Conducted by Elizabeth Scalia, Research Librarian

Search Alert in EBSCOhost's ERIC and Education Source, set on 12/21/2020:

(covid* OR covid-19* OR pandemic* OR coronavirus*) in Select a field, optional

AND

TI(school* OR education* OR students OR families OR family OR parents OR parent OR classroom* OR instruction* OR youth OR children*) OR AB(school* OR education* OR students OR families OR family OR parents OR parent OR classroom* OR instruction* OR youth OR children*) in Select a field, optional

AND

("Elementary education" OR "elementary school*" OR "elementary-aged" OR "elementary secondary" OR "primary education" OR "primary school*" OR "middle school*" OR "secondary school*" OR "secondary education" OR "secondary-aged" OR "high school*" OR highschool* OR "junior high" OR TI child* OR AB child* OR SU child* OR KW child* OR SO child* OR childhood OR adolescen* OR teen* OR preteen* OR preadolescen* OR "pre-school*" OR preschool* OR "pre-kindergarten*" OR prekindergarten* OR preK* OR "pre-K" OR "pre-K12" OR "pre-K-12" OR "pre-K-12th" OR kindergarten* OR grade* OR classroom* OR K12 OR "K–12*" OR "PK–12*" OR TI school* OR AB school* OR SU school* OR KW school* OR SO school* OR students OR youth) in Select a field, optional

Limit: English language

It definitely requires human intervention from me to only select the results that they want though. And the search above isn't intended to be fully comprehensive; it's just intended to produce the (hopefully) most relevant hits according to the search terms they gave me.

I also set up 2 search alerts in Google Scholar and have to weed through those results to only select relevant ones. Here are those two.

Scholar.Google.com search:

intitle:covid k-12 Students OR schools OR classroom

Scholar.Google.com search:

allintitle: "covid 19" schools

Lastly, there are a few places that I browse manually, to find reports:

Ed Working Papers, their COVID topic: https://edworkingpapers.com/topics/covid-19-education-research-recovery

EdArXiv. https://edarxiv.org/ [Type in covid, then sort by Date, Newest to oldest, then skim]

NWEA https://www.nwea.org/research/theme/covid-19-schools (hint: they tend to post the Technical Appendix first, and then post the actual report afterward, very unnerving.)

RAND website, their COVID topic: https://www.rand.org/topics/coronavirus-disease-2019-covid-19.html

Urban Inst website, their COVID topic: https://www.urban.org/research (Click to select TAG: Covid-19)

NBER Papers, their COVID topic https://www.nber.org/topics/covid-19

CRPE, their COVID topic https://crpe.org/focus_areas/covid-19/

EdResearch for Recovery at Annenberg Institute for School Reform at Brown University https://www.edresearchforaction.org/

The Evidence Project at the Center on Reinventing Public Education https://www.evidence-project.org/ - I no longer browse the database here. Instead I browse their regular newsletter emails.

RESTART
Network

1400 Crystal Drive, 10th Floor | Arlington, VA, 22202
+1-202-403-5000 | **AIR.ORG**